

Appendix D

Chief Financial Officer appointment process

Statement of the Independent Member of the Appointment Panel

My role was as to provide an evaluation of the process to ensure that it was fair and to assess that the suitability of the candidates to this vital role within the Commissioner's management team.

Fairness of the process

In inviting five candidates meant that there was a sufficient number to enable a fair evaluation to occur. The candidates were asked to prepare a presentation to the panel based on current information relevant to the role provided. This was followed by the interview process that was based on the candidates providing answers to the same questions. One of the candidates asked to withdraw when provided with the presentation and did not provide a presentation nor did the interview process occur. I did not consider that the reduction of one candidate invalidated the process. Each member of the interview panel including me scored the remaining 4 candidates. The candidate who achieved the highest score is the one who is being put forward as the preferred candidate.

Suitability of the candidates

My aim as a qualified accountant and a former head of finance at a major Welsh Police Force was to ensure that the candidates had sufficient professional expertise to undertake the key role. In my opinion the process meant that it was possible to proceed to making a recommendation of a preferred candidate.

Preferred Candidate

I was the line manager whilst Head of Finance whilst employed at a major Welsh Police Force. That interest was declared to the rest of the panel and I had had no involvement in which of the candidates should be invited for interview. As it is fourteen years since that line management role existed, it was considered by the other members of the panel there has been a sufficient time interval for no unfair influence to arise. I fully support the appointment of the preferred candidate who achieved the highest score in the evaluation process.

Malcolm MacDonald